

Agenda – Finance Committee

Meeting Venue: Hybrid – Committee
room 3, Senedd and video conference
via Zoom

For further information contact:

Owain Roberts

Committee Clerk

Meeting date: 22 May 2024

0300 200 6388

Meeting time: 09.30

SeneddFinance@senedd.wales

Registration

(09.00–09.15)

Private Pre-meeting

(09.15–09.30)

1 Introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest

(09.30)

2 Paper(s) to note

(09.30)

(Pages 1 – 3)

Minutes of the meeting held on 1 May

2.1 PTN 1 – Letter from the PSOW: Additional information on councillor complaints – 16 May 2024

(Pages 4 – 5)

3 First Supplementary Budget 2024–25: Evidence session with the Senedd Commission

(09.30–10.00)

(Pages 6 – 26)

Hefin David MS, Commissioner for Budget and Governance

Manon Antoniazzi, Chief Executive and Clerk of the Senedd

Kate Innes, Chief Finance Officer, Senedd Commission

Ed Williams, Director of Senedd Resources, Senedd Commission

Supporting documents:

FIN(6)–13–24 P1 – Letter from the Senedd Commission – 10 May 2024



- 4 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 (ix) to resolve to exclude the public from the items 5,6,7 and 9**
- 5 First Supplementary Budget 2024-25: Consideration of evidence**
(10.00-10.15)
- 6 Wales Audit Office appointments: Consideration of draft report**
(10.15-10.30) (Pages 27 – 36)
Supporting documents:
FIN(6)-13-24 P3 – Draft report
- 7 Consideration of Forward Work Programme**
(10.30-10.45) (Pages 37 – 46)
Supporting documents:
FIN(6)-13-24 P4 – Forward Work Programme

Public

(10.45-11.45)

- 8 Fiscal Intergovernmental Relations: Evidence session 6**
(10.45-11.45) (Pages 47 – 63)
Sir Paul Silk, former Clerk at both the House of Commons and Senedd Cymru
Paul Evans, former Clerk of Committees in the House of Commons

Supporting documents:
Senedd Research Brief

Private

- 9 Fiscal Intergovernmental Relations: Consideration of evidence**
(11.45-12.00)

Concise Minutes – Finance Committee

Meeting Venue: **Hybrid – Committee room 4 Ty Hywel and video conference via Zoom**

Meeting date: Wednesday, 1 May 2024

Meeting time: 09.30 – 12.27

This meeting can be viewed on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/13895>

Hybrid

Attendance

Category	Names
Members of the Senedd:	Peredur Owen Griffiths MS (Chair) Peter Fox MS Mike Hedges MS Rhianon Passmore MS
Witnesses:	Professor Nicola McEwen, University of Glasgow Professor Michael Kenny, University of Cambridge Dr Paul Anderson, Liverpool John Moores University
Committee Staff:	Owain Roberts (Clerk) Leanne Hatcher (Second Clerk) Mike Lewis (Deputy Clerk) Christian Tipples (Researcher) Owen Holzinger (Researcher) Ben Harris (Legal Adviser)



Registration

Private Pre-meeting

1 Introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest

1.1 The Chair welcomed Members to the meeting of the Finance Committee.

2 Paper(s) to note

2.1 The papers were noted.

2.1 PTN 1 – Letter from the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Constitution & Cabinet Office: Welsh Tax Acts etc. (Power to Modify) Act 2022 – 19 April 2024

2.2 PTN 2 – Letter from the Counsel General: Update on the recommendations made in the Finance Committee's report on the Financial implications of the Senedd Cymru (Members and Elections) Bill – 23 April 2024

2.3 PTN 3 – Letter from the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Constitution & Cabinet Office regarding two analytical reports which use income tax data to explore migration – 24 April 2024

2.11 PTN 4 – Letter from the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Constitution & Cabinet Office: Response to recommendations made in the Finance Committee's report on the Second Supplementary Budget 2023–24 – 25 April 2024

3 Fiscal Intergovernmental Relations: Evidence session 3

3.1 The Committee took evidence on its inquiry into Fiscal Intergovernmental Relations from Professor Nicola McEwen, Director of the Centre for Public Policy at the University of Glasgow; and Professor Michael Kenny, Director at Bennett Institute for Public Policy, University of Cambridge.

Break

4 Fiscal Intergovernmental Relations: Evidence session 4

4.1 The Committee took evidence on its inquiry into Fiscal Intergovernmental Relations from Dr Paul Anderson, Senior Lecturer in Politics at Liverpool John Moores University.

5 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 (ix) to resolve to exclude the public from the remainder of this meeting

5.1 The motion was agreed.

6 Fiscal Intergovernmental Relations: Consideration of evidence

6.1 The Committee considered the evidence received.

7 Review into the operations, processes and investigations carried out by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales: Terms of Reference

7.1 The Committee agreed its terms of reference and approach to its review into the operations, processes and investigations carried out by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales.

8 Update on the Wales Audit Office Board Membership

8.1 The Committee considered the paper relating to the Wales Audit Office Board Membership and agreed the action points included within the paper.



Ombwdsmon
Ombudsman
Cymru • Wales

Your ref:

Ask for: Michelle Morris

Our ref: MAM/mdm



Date: 16 May 2024



Peredur Owen Griffiths
Chair, Finance Committee

By email only
seneddfinance@senedd.wales

Dear Peredur

I write further to the Committee's request for information on the "number of council officer complaints about councillors and the number of councillor on councillor complaints"

We do not routinely record the 'status' of complainants who bring complaints of alleged breaches of the Code of Conduct to the PSOW. However, having undertaken a manual review of our recent cases we have established that:

Councillor v Councillor complaints

2023/24 – 30% of cases received were made by councillors (99 of the 328 cases)

2024/25 year to date – 30% of cases received were made by councillors (10 of the 34 cases)

Officer v Councillor complaints

2023/24 – 9% of cases received were made by officers (30 of the 328 cases)

2024/25 year to date – 3% of cases received were made by officers (1 of the 34 cases received)

It is important to emphasise that these figures are based on the information which complainants have chosen to share with us when they made their complaint to us either because they have used the prefix 'Cllr' or because their status is evident from the nature of the complaint which has been outlined.

ombwdsmon.cymru
holwch@ombwdsmon.cymru
0300 790 0203
1 Ffordd yr Hen Gae, CF 35 5LJ
Rydym yn hapus i dderbyn ac
ymateb i ohebiaeth yn y Gymraeg.

ombudsman.wales
ask@ombudsman.wales
0300 790 0203
1 Ffordd yr Hen Gae, CF 35 5LJ
We are happy to accept and respond
to correspondence in Welsh.

Whilst the figures may not therefore be wholly accurate, we trust that this information provides the Committee with a helpful indication of the nature of our caseload.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "M.M. Morris". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Michelle Morris
Public Services Ombudsman

Agenda Item 3

By virtue of paragraph(s) ix of Standing Order 17.42

Document is Restricted

Supplementary Budget 2024-25: Explanatory Memorandum

May 2024



The Welsh Parliament is the democratically elected body that represents the interests of Wales and its people. Commonly known as the Senedd, it makes laws for Wales, agrees Welsh taxes and holds the Welsh Government to account.

Supplementary Budget 2024-25: Explanatory Memorandum

May 2024

An electronic copy of this document can be found on the Senedd website:

www.senedd.wales

Copies of this document can also be obtained in accessible formats including Braille, large print, audio or hard copy from:

Welsh Parliament
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1NS

Tel: **0300 200 6565**

© **Senedd Commission Copyright 2024**

The text of this document may be reproduced free of charge in any format or medium providing that it is reproduced accurately and not used in a misleading or derogatory context. The material must be acknowledged as copyright of the Senedd Commission and the title of the document specified.





Senedd Cymru Welsh Parliament

Pack Page 14

Contents

Background	6
Explanatory memorandum	7
Budget Amendments	8
Pension Valuation Adjustments - Commission Staff	8
Pension Valuation Adjustments - Members	8
Payscale adjustments	9
Budget Ambit	11

Background

The 2024-25 Commission Budget was included in the Annual Budget Motion under Standing Order 20.26 and was approved in Plenary on 15 November 2023, following scrutiny by the Senedd's Finance Committee.

The budget motion provided the Commission with £72.195 million of Resource Budget in relation to:

- Expenditure under the Commission's direct control for operations;
- Project Fund (including Capital);
- Two ring-fenced budgets for specific project work;
 - Expenditure relating to preparatory work for Senedd Reform;
 - Ways of Working programme of works;
- Depreciation (a non-cash expense);
- Interest expense on lease liabilities as required by International Financial Reporting Standard (IFRS) 16 (a non-cash expense);
- The budget identified for the Independent Remuneration Board's Determination on Members' Pay and Allowances.

A further £1.800 million was provided for non-cash accounting adjustments in respect of the Members of the Senedd Pension Scheme, through the Annually Managed Expenditure budget, £0.101 million was provided for costs associated with the office of the Standards Commissioner and £0.627 million for the Remuneration Board Support.

This Explanatory Memorandum is laid in compliance with Standing Order 20.32, in support of changes to be proposed to the Commission's approved 2024-25 budget, via a Supplementary Budget Motion.

Explanatory memorandum

The effect of the Commission's supplementary budget will be to increase the overall Commission budget by £0.635 million with a corresponding increase in the net cash requirement. The following changes are proposed:

- **An increase to the Commission's operational budget of £0.275 million to reflect the change to the employer's contribution to the civil service pension scheme;**
- **A reduction in the budget for Members' salaries and related costs of £0.096 million to reflect a reduction in the employer's pension contributions;**
- **An increase in the Commission's operational budget of £0.456 million to fund an adjustment to the lowest three Commission pay scales in recognition of recent inflationary pressures;**

Budget Amendments

Pension Valuation Adjustments - Commission Staff

The 2024-25 budget was laid on the 29th September 2023 and debated in Plenary on 15th November 2023. It included a statement of intent to request funding via supplementary budget process for any additional employer charges to be borne by the Commission as a result of the triennial pension revaluation of the Civil Service Pension Scheme. Additional funding was being made available by HM Treasury to directly funded bodies for this purpose. The Commission Draft Budget was laid before the revaluation was provided and therefore not included in the laid budget.

The pension revaluation means that from 2024-25 the levels of contribution payable by the Commission to the pension scheme are as follows (with previous contribution rates included for comparison):

	Current (1/4/19 - 31/3/24)	Revised (1/4/24 - 31/3/27)
Band 1 (£23,000 and under)	26.60%	28.97%
Band 2 (£23,001 to £45,500)	27.10%	28.97%
Band 3 (£45,501 to £77,000)	27.90%	28.97%
Band 4 (£77,001+)	30.30%	28.97%

The impact on the budget required by the Commission is an increase of £0.275 million

Pension Valuation Adjustments - Members

The Members' Pension was also revalued by the UK Government Actuarial Department (GAD) during financial year 2023-24 with a recommendation that the employer contribution rate be reduced from 19.9% to 18% from 1 April 2024. This has a corresponding reduction in the amount required for the budget of £0.095million. Again, this revaluation was completed too late to be included in the laid budget.

Budget impact

The impact of the two pension valuations will be:

- **An increase in the Commission's budget of £0.275 million**
- **A decrease to the budget for the Remuneration Board's Determination of £0.096 million**
- **An increase in the net cash requirement of £0.180 million.**
- **Both pension cost changes will be consolidated to the baseline for future years.**

Payscale adjustments

The Commission has a pay deal in place until March 2025 which was the basis for its budget request. As part of on-going discussions with TUS about the new pay deal from April 2025, a particular issue was raised by the TUS which is preventing negotiations from proceeding for the next pay deal for 2025-26 and following years, is that the lower pay scales within the Commission a) are failing to keep track with inflation and b) are not comparable to the equivalent pay scales in Welsh Government.

The Commission accepts this view, recognising the impact of the cost of living crisis had been felt more by the lower paid staff and the need to keep pace with market rates in order to recruit to the organisation. The Commission, in line with budgetary requirements, only budgeted for the current pay deal for 2024-25. An adjustment to pay scales has been proposed with a cost of £0.456million. The Commission would be unable to fund the changes to the pay scales from existing budgets due to the scale of programme delivery in 2024-25 for Senedd Reform and Ways of Working and the need to maintain sufficient staffing resources to do so.

The proposals would see the lowest 3 pay scales change as follows:

Pay scale	Pay point	Current	Proposed
TS	1	£23,781	£24,500
TS	2	£24,922	£26,250

Pay scale	Pay point	Current	Proposed
TS	3	£26,062	£28,000
EO	1	£27,365	£29,400
EO	2	£28,294	£30,870
EO	3	£29,540	£32,414
EO	4	£32,840	£34,034
HEO	1	£35,158	£35,736
HEO	2	£37,015	£37,523
HEO	3	£38,847	£39,399
HEO	4	£42,635	£42,635

Grades above HEO are unaffected and will receive the current budgeted rate of increase. Key requirement in resolving the pay scale issue has also been the need to maintain the 5% band differential which has resulted in all pay bands to HEO band 3 requiring adjustment as can be seen in the table above.

Budget impact

The impact would be:

- **An increase in the Commission’s budget of £0.456 million**
- **An increase in the net cash requirement of £0.456 million**
- **This cost will be consolidated into the baseline for future years.**

Budget Ambit

This supplementary budget submission is laid in compliance with Senedd Standing Order 20 to assist in the compilation of the Budget Motion required by Section 126 of the Government of Wales Act 2006. This submission seeks to amend the resource and annually managed expenditure requirements of the Senedd Commission for the year ending 31 March 2025.

The Supplementary Budget Motion authorises the net resources to be used for the services and purposes of Members and Senedd Services. The motion includes the maximum income (or accruing resources) that may be retained for use on those services and purposes instead of being paid into the Welsh Consolidated Fund, and the cash amount that will need to be issued from the Welsh Consolidated Fund to meet the anticipated net amounts falling due for payment by the Commission.

The amended 2024-25 Budget for the Senedd Commission, addressing the revised requirements, is set out in Table 1 below.

Resources other than accruing resources for use by the Senedd Commission (“the Commission”) on resource and capital costs associated with the administration and operation of services to support the Senedd; promotion of the Senedd including payments to the Electoral Commission and others; payments in respect of the Commissioner for Standards and Remuneration Board; any other payments relating to functions of the Senedd or the Commission. Resources other than accruing resources for use by the Commission in respect of decisions of the Remuneration Board and expenditure in respect of Members of the Senedd Pension provision.	72,830
Accruing resources for retention pursuant to section 120(2) of the Government of Wales Act 2006 and use by the Commission: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ from the disposal of fixed assets and other capital income for use on the purchase or acquisition of fixed assets; or ▪ rental income; gifts; grants; recharges and income from commercial sales and other services provided to the public or others for use on administrative costs of the Senedd. 	£100
Amount to be issued from the Welsh Consolidated Fund to meet the anticipated amounts falling due for payment in the year in respect of the above services and purposes less expected retainable receipts and recoverable VAT	68,000

Table 2 below reconciles the net resource requirement to the cash drawing requirement from the Welsh Consolidated Fund.

Table 2: Cash requirement	£'000 2024-25 Laid	£'000 2024-25 Revised
Members' net revenue requirement	19,180	19,084
Office of the Standards Commissioner	101	102
Independent Remuneration Board Costs	627	634
Senedd Reform	666	671
Ways of Working	281	281
Commission net revenue requirement	46,391	47,109
Net capital requirement	3,149	3,149
Annually Managed Expenditure	1,800	1,800
Subtotal	72,195	72,830
Adjustments		
Depreciation	(4,750)	(4,750)
Interest charges/Capital adjustments	(610)	(610)
Rental payments	2,330	2,330
Movements in provisions	(1,800)	(1,800)
Movement in debtors and creditors	0	0
Subtotal	(4,830)	(4,830)
Net cash requirement from the Welsh Consolidated Fund	67,365	68,000
Increase in cash requirement		635

By virtue of paragraph(s) ix of Standing Order 17.42

Document is Restricted

Document is Restricted

Document is Restricted

Document is Restricted